#### Waste and Environmental Streetscene Services Contract

## **BENEFITS REALISATION (CLOSED)**

### For contract period August 2006 to August 2013

<sup>1</sup> The origins are:

a) Procurement Process (identified through Project Board, Elected Member Groups, Project Team and Stakeholder/Soft Market Testing Meetings (PP).

 $^{1}$ Red = Insufficient progress. Amber =Some progress made but additional focus/efforts required to fully achieve. Green = Desired benefit/outcome/gain realised or on track

b) Gateway 4 Review (G4R).

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
1 3 6 29 10 9	A reliable waste collection service. Residual Waste co-mingling recycling Garden Waste Assisted collections Bulky Waste Rapid Response replacement bin deliveries	Various Contract Clauses. Clause 6.11 Clause 7.2.3	<ul> <li>1/3/6/29: KPI/WR 1 – Missed collections / 100k collections.</li> <li>10. KPI/ WR2 (a) No of missed bulky household collections (outside 10 day SLA)</li> <li>9. KPI/SC4 (h) No of responses out of time (2 hours +)</li> </ul>	30/ 100,00 0 0%	Average monthly score for residual waste collections per 100,000 properties in 2012: Green bins: 20/100,000 Grey Bins: 10/100,000 Brown bins: 10/100,000 Average number of responses in time: 2012: ERIC service requests: 0% failures Rapid responses: 5% out of time Fly tip removals: 0.5% out of time Dead Animal removal: 7.5% out of time Bin replacements: 0.34% out of time Asbestos removal: 3.2% out of time (1 incident)	PP G4R	G Benefit Realised – KPI suit to be included in new benefits plan post February 18 <sup>th</sup> 2013

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
7	Satisfactory cleansing of jiggers, rear alleyways and entries.	New service required by Clause 7.11 in the Contract Document.	<ul> <li>(a) No of complaints of unsatisfactory cleansing operations.</li> <li>(b) Daily Contract monitoring.</li> </ul>	(a) Nil (b) Contrac t Inspecti on Perfor- mance level.	<ul> <li>Biffa have been served a rectification notice (Dec 2012) due to reporting issues and unsatisfactory cleansing standards.</li> <li>Entries are not currently part of the "Streets 1" joint inspections.</li> <li>2013 Partnership work stream to include setting new KPI (or inclusion of entries in Streets 1) and audit process for entry cleansing in 2013. Waste volumes over contract period to be assessed to determine operational barriers to achieving benefit</li> </ul>	PP	A Benefit to be included in subsequent benefits plan. Partnering Board work stream focus for 2013/14
12	Provision of a Removal of Shopping Trolley Service.	New service required by inclusion of Clause 7.24 in the Contract Document (provisional item).	(a) Number of missed collections outside SLA.	Nil	No requests to date outside of normal working hours.	PP	G Not required due to successful supermarket strategies

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
18	Easier access for the public to register complaints about the Service.	(a) Improvement to the CRM system.	No of services on CRM. Customer 1 (CR1) No of stage 1 complaints received regarding contract	All service s to be include d in CRM by August 2007. Cont improve ment expecte d.	All services are now on CRM and Corporate IT progressing customer online reporting options. Bin replacement queries process improved to facilitate implementation of bin charging policy approved in 2009 leading to savings and income generation of 70K per annum Complaints monitored though DMT and broken down into type for appropriate action. Average 5 complaints per month 2012.	PP G4R	G Benefit Realised

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
24	To increase awareness of recycling in Schools and Communities.	The provision and take-up of Streetscene education and awareness programmes. The provision of in- school recycling facilities.	Local PI - number of participating schools.	<ul> <li>(a) 50% of schools by March 2008.</li> <li>(b) 95% of schools by 2009.</li> <li>(c) 95% of schools by 2010.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>100% schools originally serviced joined new scheme implemented Sept 2008.</li> <li>Council introduced charges for residual waste collection in Nov 2012 to drive recycling performance.</li> <li>Council have funded a full time eco-school officer and associated budget to promote recycling and LEQ initiatives</li> </ul>	PP	G Benefit realised

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
28	The public to be satisfied that wheeled bins are returned to the agreed collection points after emptying.	All wheeled-bins are to be returned to the agreed collection point after emptying as per Clause 6.5.2 of the Contract.	Key PIs (a) GP1 formal complaints. (b) GP2 crew checks.	(a) Nil (b) Target for crew checks =89% pass rate.	Crew checks being carried out by Biffa under terms of self- monitoring contract. (96% pass rate average during 2012). New Joint audit process implemented in Dec 2011. Procedure implemented for managing complaints about bins not being returned correctly. Operational since August 2008.	PP	G Benefit Realised – KPI suit to be included in new benefits plan
30	All collections to be carried out without spillages or spillages to be cleared immediately by the bin crew.	Clause 6.18 in the Contract requires the Contractor to rectify complaints of spillages within two hours.	Key PIs (a) Customer 1: formal complaints. (b) GP2 crew checks.	<ul> <li>(a) Nil complai nts</li> <li>(b) Target for crew checks =89% pass rate.</li> </ul>	Crew check procedure includes identification of spillages during the lifting process and to ensure proper tools are on board to deal with spillages. 2012: 96% pass rate	PP	G Benefit Realised – KPI suit to be included in new benefits plan

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
33	Reduction in litter on highways	A formalised litter bin emptying specification is included in the new Contract to prevent spillages via clause 7.16.2	KPI Streets 1 KPI Streets 2 : Overflowing litter bins	92% pass rate (litter and detritus ) based on NI195 method ology) Continu ous improve ment expecte d	No longer a national indicator but retained principals for local PI Joint inspections carried out 3 times per week by client team and Biffa on day of cleanse. 2012 Pass rate 96.66% 2012: 11% of responses out of time however mainly due to delays in admin procedures as opposed to operational failures	PP	G Benefit Realised – KPI suit to be included in new benefits plan

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
23	A reliable cleansing service for all traffic islands.	The Contractor has been made aware of this key area of the Street Cleansing Service via Client/Contracto r meetings.	BV199(a) – detritus on main roads.	Year on year improve -ments.	Monitored as part of street cleansing audits Biffa made series of operational changes 20011/12 to realise this benefit	PP	G Benefit Realised

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
5	An increase in recycling levels to meet and where possible exceed all Government Recycling Targets.	Introduction of alternate weekly dry recycling collection service	NI192 % household waste recycled and composted NI193 % Municipal waste landfilled	08/09: 34%: 09/10: 35.5% 10/11: 37% 11/12: 38% 12/13: 40%	LAA Targets (NI 192): 08/09: 36.3% achieved 09/10: 36.21% achieved 10/11: 39% achieved 11/12: 40.6% predicted 12/13: 41.7% projected Two bin project jointly undertaken to reduce residual capacity of households who present additional unauthorised residual bins.	PP G4R	G Benefit Realised – KPI suit to be included in new benefits plan

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
26	Continual reduction (year on year) in the amounts of waste deposited in landfill (tonnages).	Performance monitoring of service provision to ensure good quality services from Contractor.	NI191 kg/household/ year household waste sent to landfill	08/09: 636kg/h h 09/10:6 31kg/hh 10/11: 626 kg/hh 11/12: 530kg/h h 12/13: 510kg/h h	Roll out of AWC's and ongoing improvement has drastically improved figure from 06/07. NI191 08/09: 592.34Kg 09/10: 577.69kg 10/11: 543.18kg 11/12 :527kg 12/13 : 500 kg/hh	PP	G Benefit Realised – KPI suit to be included in new benefits plan
32	Reduction in the amounts of residual waste presented at kerbside and increase capture of recyclables		See benefits <b>26</b> a	and <b>5</b>		PP	G Benefit Realised

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
19	To promote the use of Environmental options within the Streetscene Operations Services in line with the Council's Environmental Policy.	This is a requirement under Method Statement 18 of the Contract Document.	Number and use of environment tally friendly processes, materials and products.	To be complet ed in year 2 of the contract	WRATE analysis to measure carbon impact on the Environmental Streetscene Services show a current carbon saving of 31000t of Carbon per annum from the baseline position at the start of the contract (2006 to 2010) Contractor to carry out further analysis by March 2014 to re- calculate based on contract review operational changes.	PP	G Benefit Realised

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
13	Joint management of key risks associated with the contract (where appropriate).	Monitoring function via partnering board standard agenda item from March 2013 onwards	N/A	N/A	2012 Risks / Projects managed by Partnering Board via work stream monitoring Departmental Risk Register highlights contractual risks Annual update to Sustainable Communities O and S Committee. Specific Partnership Risk Register agreed to be developed in response to Contract Review and Budget challenges 2013/14 onwards	PP GR4	G Benefit realised
16	Better joined up working between all Streetscene Services (including Grounds Maintenance).	Method Statement 7 required Biffa to provide details of improved joined up working.	Key issues include the linking of the Tranmere Pathfinder enforcement fly- tipping clearance work with the Contractor.	Continu al Improv ement.	Joint approach implemented for road closures Limited opportunities due to operational nature of separate services/ round structures etc.	PP	G Benefit realised

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
17	New partnering arrangements with local community groups and local residents to promote increased recycling and cleaner streets.	Method Statement 7 required Biffa to provide details of improved joined up working.	Identified resources to implement benefit.	Resour ce to be in place by March 2008.	Joint funded Community Engagement Officer post is now in place. This post has been filled on a permanent basis, since April 2011 but has been vacant since March 2012, stalling progress noted below. Recruitment delayed due to spending freeze and current budget pressures. Citizens Charter to Beechwood and Ballantyne launched. Service area has won Nationally recognised awards from APSE and KBT for partnership working within the communities. Wirral Community Enviro-Champs network established. Frontline engagement team deployed to educate residents re recycling having positive impact on recycling quality.	PP G4R	A Benefit partially achieved but scope for much stronger community links : To be continued in new benefits plan post 2013

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
31	Closer working relations with the Merseyside Recycling and Waste Authority (MRWA – formerly the Merseyside Waste Disposal Authority)	Linkages at officer and Member level where appropriate.	Attendance at SOWG meetings and sub group meetings	100% attenda nce	<ul> <li>100% attendance currently achieved</li> <li>Sub groups attended include: Performance Group, Operations group, Waste Awareness and Prevention group (Wirral Chair).</li> <li>Joint Merseyside Waste management Strategy developed ratified by all Merseyside Councils Nov 2012</li> <li>Wirral CEO resumed lead officer for LCR Waste and Environment to initiate high level discussions regarding partnership working.</li> </ul>	PP G4R	G Benefit realised

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
20	Embrace the concept of Best Value in all service delivery.	This is required by Method Statement 19 in the Contract Document.	Best Value Performance Indicators for Waste and Street Cleansing.	Top quartile results for all NI's. 15	<ul> <li>BV report on waste collection completed for finance August 2008.</li> <li>Garden Waste Procurement realised £190K savings from 2010.</li> <li>Biffa's AWC round restructures has reduced overall fleet requirements.</li> <li>Compaction trial also aims to improve efficiency of grey bin service.</li> <li>60K saving from improved street sweeping efficiencies</li> <li>V. E. project to make 3 monthly payments in advance for core contract items, has realised savings of £132,000 per annum during 2010/11.</li> <li>Break Clause Contract Review Identified 1.2M savings to be realised by August 2013.</li> </ul>	PP	G Benefit realised. Improvements in performance against reduced cost base.

	No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
funding by joint     the general     external funding     ar     previous funding       Client/Contractor     Contract     year on year.     sources being secured	21	Client/Contractor	Contract	•	£50k/ye ar	sources being secured and utilised by the Council 400K plus external funding secured between 06/07 and 11/12 12/13 MRWA funding (around 20K) secured for various community engagement projects; 15K secured from NHS to subsidise the Sharps	PP	G Benefit realised

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
27	Effective communication between Contractor and Client in real time information in all service delivery which in turn will improve information to customers on service provision.	Requirement of Method Statement 14. Biffa agreed to set up and implement a 'real time' communication system and integration of the system into the Council's own Management Information System (MIS).	Percentage of crews provided with and trained for PDA's.	Techno -logy to be in place and fully operati on al by August 2007. Full integrati on of Biffa Spring- board with CRM by Decem ber 2007.	PDA technology being used by all waste collection crews but retraining / monitoring required to ensure proper usage. Call centre / 1-stop shops and client have been trained and have access to real time info from PDA's. Phase 1 Integration with CRM (to allow automatic closure and updating of missed bin task status) completed during 2010 completed 2010/11. Phase 2 expansion; to include Bin Deliveries, Street Cleansing and ERIC collections not completed due to re- prioritisation of Council IT projects. Bin deliveries completed Nov 2012. Biffa have produced an alternative solution to achieve some of the benefits of real time PDA information that was planned to be delivered through Phase 2.	PP G4R	G

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
37	Contract Default Procedure to be made explicit and client user- friendly.	Clause 4.47 details the new processes for action by the Client where appropriate.	Local Performance Indicator – Number of Default Notices and Rectification Notices served on the Contract each month.	This is a reactive Perform ance Indicato r.	08/09 £35,025.00 default recovery 09/10 £650.00 default recovery 10/11 and 11/12 no requirement for default penalties. 12/13 Currently no requirement for default penalties, however 1 x Rectification Notice Served around Entry Cleansing standards/contractor reporting. Contractor in process of responding and reviewing operational/supervisory approach to this area of service delivery	PP	G Benefit realised

No.	Desired Benefit/Outcome/ Gains	Means of Compliance	Performance Indicator/s	Targets	Outputs/Progress to date	Origin of Desired Benefit/ Outcome/Gain	Final Benefit Status
38	Any default financial reductions (via liquidated damages) should be realistic and at real cost to the council	Default values have been increased by 70% from the old contract to correspond to the Council	There will be a periodic assessment of default costs to ensure these are reasonable	N/A	The stated financial deductions clauses were considered appropriate at the commencement of the contract. No liquidated damage claims have been claimed by the Council to date.	PP	G Benefit realised

# **BENEFITS TIMELINE: BENEFITS CLOSED prior to August 2013 (within 7-year initial contract period)**

The following "benefit realisation" items have been closed because they had already been achieved prior to 2013 or no longer form part of the Streetscene contract (or considered not relevant):

BR ref	BR description Origin Reason for CLOSURE of Benefit		Date	Cross Ref to	
2	Rapid introduction of an alternate weekly residual/dry recyclate collection service.	PP G4R	Achieved	March 2011	n/a
4	The proper emptying of bring sites to be kept clean and tidy in between collections.	PP	Bring Site Service Ceased: Break Clause Review Saving. Biffa still responsible for cleansing bring site areas on Council land.	November 2012	n/a
8	Proper removal of graffiti and fly posters.	PP G4R	Provisional Service taken out of contract due to high cost. The Council now manages a separate full time graffiti removal contract	2008	n/a
11	Provision of a reliable clinical waste service.	PP	Provisional item not used: Council do not operate a doorstep collection service. Council part fund a pharmacy drop off service ran by the PCT	2006	n/a

BR ref				Date	Cross Ref to
. 14	Agreement by Client/Contractor of a full range of Performance Indicators to be used as a tool to facilitate continual service improvement.	PP GR4	Achieved. Key Performance Indicators were agreed by the Partnering Board at their meeting on 20.03.07. The KPIs are reported to the Partnering Board at their regular quarterly meetings and reviewed to reflect performance and priorities and service requirements	March 2007	
15	Provision and realisation of a new Partnering Agreement through the establishment of a new Partnering Board.	PP G4R	New outcome realised by the agreement being included in the Contract Document.	2006	n/a
22	New provision of a collection, treatment and disposal service for hazardous waste	PP	Achieved: Fluorescent tube service available to schools and offices All other hazardous waste assigned to MRWA but collected by contractor through agreed processes (Asbestos,	2006 Ongoing	n/a
25	A regular day waste/recycling collection service even during holiday periods	PP	Achieved: bank holiday collections except Xmas day, Boxing day and New Years day	2007	
34	A simplified Recycling Container Specification which the citizen is satisfied with.	PP	Roll out of co-mingled dry recycling service achieved Co-mingled organic collection ceased due to IVC failure and public dissatisfaction with regards to putting loose food waste in bins.	March 2011	n/a

BR ref	BR description	Date	Cross Ref to		
35	Realisation of Capital Sums from the sale of land or building assets as a result of the implementation of the new Contract.PPKelvinside Depot and Southend Depot now not in use. Savings 		2007	n/a	
36	Increase in income from recovered recycled materials.	m recovered highest possible re-sale value from recovered materials via		2006	n/a
39	A re-profiled Client Structure.	PP G4R	Client re-organisation completed December 2007 Further restructure in 2008 to reflect benefits of a self-monitoring contract.	2008	n/a
40	A streamlined budget-setting process.	PP	Achieved but not quantified. New Contract streamlined budget setting/ monitoring process due to closure of accounts. Cost Centre Maintenance is minimised (one Contractor / transfer of employees Potential savings in finance budget costs and other service costs.	April 2007	n/a
41			April 2010	n/a	
42	Evaluation and possible re- assignment of the existing Paper Contract with Shotton.	PP	Not achieved as Shotton did not respond to Council requests. No longer applicable as MRF contractor now negotiate direct with Shotton for all grades of paper. Officers carried out full risk review and consider risk of challenge by Shotton to be low, and risk of success of challenge to be very low.	November 2011	n/a

#### Quantitative Benefits Realisation Waste and Environmental Streetscene Services Contract: 2006-2013

BR ref	BR description	Benefit Origin	Target amount	Target Date	Progress	RAG Status	Benefit/ risk owner	Accumulative save to March 2013 £
20	Embrace the concept of Best Values in all Service Delivery	PP	Not specified	Not specified	Garden Waste procurement reducing fleet by 1 x RCV; Removal of street sweeper due to good performance; One off core payment reduction for advanced payments part funding of Community Engagement Officer, early realisation of bring site savings	Green	Not Specified	>1,200,000
21	To obtain external funding by joint client/contractor initiatives	PP	50К ра	life of contract	Average of 70K pa secured 2006-2013	Green	Contractor/ client joint	>430,000
35	Realisation of Capital Sums from sale of land or building assets as a result of implementation of new contract	PP	None Specified	None Specified	Kelvinside depot being leased by another Council Department and Southend Depot sold in 2007 for sum of 91K.	Green	Client	>90,000
37/38	Defaults arising from application of contract default procedure	PP	None Specified	None Specified	Defaults issued:06/07: £0; 07/08:£308,635; 08/09: £31,075; 09/10 £8150 10/11 £0 11/12: £0 12/13 £200	Green	Client	>300,000
L	1	1	1	1	1	1	TOTAL SAVING TO DATE £	>2,000,000

			Cont	tractual Costs	(Tracking)			
N/A	Preferred bidder Prices realised through contract life	N/A	Tender price for tendered Core Services: £10,249,668 subject to property uplift plus RPI	End of contract period	Final contract price (inc property uplift plus RPI: £12,407,292. Adjustment made in 2007 for bank holiday payments reported at time of award (May 8th ,2006 Cabinet) of £237Kpa and subject to RPI	Green	Client	£0 variance to specified contractual prices reported in May 8th, 2006 Cabinet Report: Contract Award decision (Excludes VO's raised for addition/removal of services since that date). Additional £1,835,662 variance from Tender Price over 7 years for bank holiday payments
N/A	Cost of additional services required during contract term (excluding provisional items)	n/a	n/a	End of contract period	Bulk recycling round; Exclusion Round; Expansion of garden waste services; Hard to reach round recycling; Abandoned bin collections	Green	Client	Total cost to March 2013: £2,342,238